



**ORDER IN THE MATTER OF COMPLAINT FILED BY COLONEL MALIK MUHAMMAD IFTIKHAR KHAN F/O AYESHA IFTIKHAR AGAINST AL NAFEES MEDICAL COLLEGE ISLAMABAD REGARDING IRREGULARITIES IN ADMISSION PROCESS SESSION 2022-23.**


1. Colonel Malik Muhammad Iftikhar Khan F/o Ayesha Iftikhar (the “Complainant”) filed a complaint on 27.03.2023 against Al Nafees Medical College, Islamabad regarding irregularities in admission process session 2022-23. Brief facts of the complaint are as under:
2. The Complainant submitted that his daughter namely Ayesha Iftikhar (the studnet) applied online for admission in MBBS program in Al-Nafees Medical College, Islamabad with aggregate merit of 66.34%. Confirmation of online application was received from the college official website. However, it has been reliably learnt that the Al Nafees Medical College, Islamabad Campus has granted admission to a low merit student which is clear violation of policies issued by the PM&DC as well as depriving the admission rights of his daughter.
3. Complaint was forwarded to the Principal of Al Nafees Medical College, Islamabad with the direction to submit comments along with record. The Principal Al Nafees Medical College, Islamabad submitted his comments dated 31-03-2023 wherein he stated that
  - a. The admitting university for Al Nafees Medical College & Hospital is Isra University Hyderabad.
  - b. The letter has been forwarded to Chancellor Isra University Hyderabad and he has ordered an inquiry to probe the matter.”
4. Since no satisfactory reply was received from the Principal of the College on merits of the case therefore, the matter was fixed for personal hearing before the Registrar on 10-04-2023. Notices were issued to both the parties for the said date. On the date of hearing the Complainant appeared in person whereas the Respondent remained absent. Consequently, the hearing was adjourned for 11-04-2023 for which the Principal of the College was again informed through email.
5. On 11-04-2023, the Complainant as well as Prof Salman Ahmed Principal of the Al-Nafees Medical College and Mr. Tufail Khan Additional Director Admin and Finance Isra University appeared before the Registrar. The Complainant reiterated contents of his complaint. He further added that after submitting online application for admission which was duly acknowledged by the College, the College was contacted multiple times regarding further developments in admission, however no clear and positive response was received from the College. The Complainant submitted a printout of his call log which shows that multiple calls were made on the College phone number on different dates before the closure of admissions. The Complainant stated that the College or Isra University never contacted him for submission of fee and completion of admission process.

6. The Principal of the College stated that he is academic in-charge only and has nothing to do with the admissions. The Principal submitted Final Merit list of the College which clearly shows that the closing aggregate merit at Al-Nafees Medical College was 63.969. The Principal further stated that Mr. Tufail Khan Additional Director Admin Isra University is responsible person to handle admissions of Al-Nafees College from the Isra University Islamabad Campus.
7. Mr. Tufail Khan, Additional Director Admin and Finance when asked what was the reason to not grant admission to the Complainant's daughter, he could not give a satisfactory answer and asked for the details of the student from the Complainant. Mr. Khan was then asked to provide complete record pertaining to admission application of the Complainant's daughter to which he stated that he has not brought any record. When asked about the provisional merit list of students who applied for admission, he stated that provisional list was uploaded on the portal of PMDC. However as per record available no provisional list was uploaded by the Al-Nafees Medical College or the Isra University. This casual attitude in the hearing raises serious questions upon the conduct of management of Isra University and Al-Nafees Medical College. Mr. Tufail Khan was directed to submit provisional merit list through email which was submitted by him.
8. The list claimed to be 'provisional merit list' does not even contain the column of aggregate marks of each student. This raises the question that how without mentioning the aggregate marks of student against his/her name merit list could be compiled? How one would know that the student mentioned at serial number 1 was actually at the top of the merit list when his/her aggregate marks are not mentioned on the list. The list submitted by the Additional Director Admin of ISRa University to the maximum can be called an information list containing personal details of each student but it cannot be called a merit list at all.
9. Responding to the question how the Isra University communicated with the students with respect to submission of fee, the Additional Director again relied on the same merit list, where the last Column is 'Status Calls' and against the name of the Complainant's daughter which is at serial number 1117 it is mentioned that 'Call not Responding'. This entry is again very vague. It is not mentioned when the call was made and at what time. Furthermore, no call log has been produced. On the other hand, the Complainant has submitted a detailed call log which shows that numerous calls were made by him to the College admission office on different dates before the close of admissions.
10. It has been noted with concern that as per written response of Principal of Al-Nafees Medical College the admissions are handled by Isra University Hyderabad and the Complaint was forwarded to Isra University Hyderabad. However, during the hearing, he mentioned that admissions are handled by Mr. Tufail Khan who is employee of Isra University Islamabad Campus. This misleading stance of the Principal further raises questions about the admission process of Isra University and Al-Nafees Medical College.
11. From the perusal of record and statement of parties it becomes evident that there are serious discrepancies in the admission process of Al-Nafees Medical College and Isra University. The record submitted by the representative of Isra University raises serious concern about the transparency of admission process at Al-Nafees Medical College, Islamabad.
12. It has been noted that the Final merit list available on record shows that the closing merit of Al-Nafees Medical College was 63.969 whereas the aggregate of Ms. Ayesha Iftikhar

was 66.34 which is higher than the closing merit. This clearly shows that the student was not granted admission despite being on the higher merit. The Principal of Al-Nafees Medical College and Additional Director Admin of Isra University have miserably failed to bring on record any document to substantiate their stance.

13. In view of the above, Al-Nafees Medical College and Isra University are directed to grant admission to the student namely Miss Ayesha Ifthikhar who has higher aggregate i.e. 66.34 and well within the merit list as the closing merit of Al-Nafees Medical College was 63.969. The College shall grant admission to Miss Ayesha Ifthikhar within the allocated number of seats. Furthermore, fine of Rupees 1,500,000 is imposed upon the College for wrongfully denying admission to Ms. Aysha Ifthikhar in violation of merit. The College shall submit compliance report within 10 working days of receipt of this order.
14. Additionally, as observed hereinabove the College admitted students on lower merit score than Ms. Ayesha Ifthikhar, therefore it is essential that entire admission process of Al-Nafees Medical College must be scrutinized by the relevant department of the PM&DC and in case of any violation, appropriate action shall be taken. Disposed off.

Dated: 11 April, 2023

  
**Dr. Suleman Ahmed**  
**Acting Registrar**  
**Pakistan Medical and Dental Council**